

## Summaries

### **Grigore Panțiru**, *Une Nouvelle Interprétation de la Notation Écphonétique d'un Manuscrit à Iași, Roumanie*

This paper represents in a nutshell Fr Grigore Panțiru's contribution to the topic of the interpretation and practical significance of 10<sup>th</sup> – 11<sup>th</sup> century ekphonic notation, as applied to the only complete 10<sup>th</sup> century Greek Gospel Lectionary with ekphonic notation found in Romanian repositories. The approach presented essentially in this paper, and originally published in „Studies in Eastern Chant“, vol. III, 1973, Oxford University Press, New York-Toronto, p. 124-140, was subsequently developed in the monograph *Lecționarul evanghelic de la Iași*, Editura Muzicală, București, 1982, also containing the black and white facsimile of the MS.

In Fr Grigore Panțiru's interpretation, which is based on correlating theoretical knowledge with practical usage, the pattern of the distribution and placement of the ekphonic neumes points to a straightforward recitative usage of the signs, devoid of musical formulae: the musical function of the neumes is determined by their position with respect to the liturgical text, i.e. above it, underneath it, in its middle, or at its end, and by the relationship of each individual neumes group to the fundamental note of the recitative.

This paper received at first a fairly enthusiastic, then mixed reception from western scholars, but the criticism points, based as they are on compiling results attained by other scholars on a much greater variety of MSS, and summarized in English by Egon Wellesz at the end of this paper, retain their validity without definitively refuting Fr Panțiru's theory. An interesting point made by Wellesz is the one regarding the dating of the MS, an area to which two Italian scholars, Marco D'Agostino and Sandra Martani have recently devoted a number of studies published in the issues VII and VIII of *Acta Musicae Byzantinae*. Wellesz states that he identified – on the basis of comparisons with the tables in V. Gardthausen's *Griechische Palaeographie* – in this MS the last stage of uncial writing, named “Liturgical Uncial”, where the letters exhibit the shape known as “pre-Slavonic”, which seems again to point out in the direction of Ochrid.

### **Gheorghe Ciobanu**, *La rythmique des neumes byzantins dans les transcriptions de I. D. Petrescu et de Egon Wellesz par rapport à la pratique actuelle*

This is one of Gheorghe Ciobanu densest papers, in which he filtered much of his combined knowledge of ethnomusicology and Byzantine chant traditions, by attempting to put in a clearer perspective the relationship between notation and rhythm, and identify valid answers to the questions posed by the still elusive topic of the validity of musical transcriptions from Eastern neumed texts. This is how he listed those answers.

1. La connaissance de la musique byzantine impose une forte connaissance des neumes de la notation de cet art.
2. Le sens des neumes a évolué continuellement à travers les siècles, jusqu'à la 'Réforme' de 1814, lorsqu'on a réduit leur nombre, excluant la plupart des 'grandes hypostases' et précisant le mieux possible le sens de chaque neume qu'on a gardé.
3. La tradition a joué un rôle important dans l'interprétation des neumes tant avant qu'après la 'Réforme'.
4. De l'ancienne tradition on n'a retenu que les éléments adoptés par la 'Réforme'; mais le déchiffrement de ce qui nous est resté implique un travail persévérant de recherches comparées.
5. E. Wellesz et I. D. Petrescu ont fait des efforts assidus pour remporter des résultats dans le déchiffrement de l'ancienne notation byzantine. Leurs méthodes de travail sont semblables et différentes à la fois. Cela peut être expliqué par les lacunes sérieuses des anciens traités théoriques, ainsi que par l'impossibilité de connaître l'ancienne tradition qui nous est parvenue par voie orale et qui n'apparaît pas dans les traités théoriques.
6. Pour connaître le rythme des anciennes mélodies byzantines antérieures à l'année 1814, on ne peut s'appuyer que sur les signes phonétiques et rythmiques, tandis que tous les autres signes ou 'grandes hypostases' restent encore inconnus.

7. Il faut étudier l'ancienne tradition plus profondément. Cela n'est possible que progressivement, partant de la tradition actuelle vers le temps reculé du début de la musique byzantine.

**Jørgen Raasted**, *Zur Analyse der bulgarisch-griechischen Melodie des Doxastikons „Bogonachalnim manoveniem“*

An unexpected, possibly coincidental, result of Jørgen Raasted's multilateral research is also represented in this paper, which illustrates the possible strong, centuries-old links between the current repertory of the Bulgarian Orthodox Church and the tradition that has acquired during the past two decades the name "Skitic tradition", after the term coined by Elena Tončeva to denote the process whereby the musical traditions of the Putna school of ecclesiastical chant were continued in those of the Great Skete (Skitul Mare) in Pocutia. Skitul Mare Monastery was founded in 1612 by the Ukrainian hesychast monk Iov Knyaginitsky and archdeacon Theodosie from Putna Monastery.

The object of the analysis is the 19<sup>th</sup> century Bulgarian Doxastikon „Bogonachalnim manoveniem“, which, while generally following the neo-Byzantine composition of Ioannes of Trebizond (ca. 1750) also demonstrates the existence of a 'conscious adaptation effort'. After recording meticulously the differences between the Greek tradition and the current, 20<sup>th</sup> century Bulgarian tradition (as recorded on normal gramophone records), and pondering on the explanations of some Bulgarian musicologists that these differences are the result of the originality of the singing traditions of Rila Monastery, the author finds that there must be some other source for this specific type of adaptation of Greek psalmody. A short time before the writing of this paper the author gained access to MS Slav 10845 of the Romanian National Library at Bucharest, dated 1684, known to Bulgarian musicology as one of the principal sources of 'Bolgarsky raspev'. The author's preliminary hypothesis is that it is precisely in the 'Skitic tradition' of 1684 that the sources of the current tradition of Bulgarian ecclesiastical chant are to be sought, but that more, in-depth research would be necessary in order to reach reliable conclusions as to the early history of the transmission of the *σύντομον νέον στιχηραρικών είδος*.

**Dimitri E. Conomos**, *The Monastery of Putna and the Musical Tradition of Moldavia in the Sixteenth Century*

Although actually confined to the study of Koinonika by Greek, Moldavian and Serbian composers, at the time when this article was published – in 1981– it represented the most detailed musical study written by a non-Romanian scholar on the ecclesiastical musical traditions of the Moldavians, with special emphasis on the Putna repertory, but with pertinent reference to the established Greek tradition, as preserved in the most representative MSS.

On the strength of the musical evidence, the author ascribes eleven Koinonika to Evstatie of Putna: ten Slavonic and one Greek, pointing out that this is a remarkably high number by late medieval standards, ranking favourably with the compositions of Kladas, Korones, and Chrysaphes, and bearing witness to a prolific and ingenious composer. The examples analyzed in the study exhibit certain particular aspects of Evstatie's psalmodic style, which comprises a common vocabulary of melodic idioms familiar from Byzantine musical practices.

The author also foreseeingly wrote at the time: "However, it would be desirable to have a more detailed study of the music preserved in the Moldavian manuscripts – a study that would relate it to the Greco-Slav tradition in general, and that would also attempt to trace those manuscripts from Putna that found their way into other communities." It appears that the time is now ripe to develop exactly that part, which traces the continuation of that part of the Putna tradition that found its way in the Slav countries, since it was only natural to find its way to the countries that directly bordered on the Romanian lands. Because to date, some 20 years after the peak of the research undertaken by the team made up of Grigore Panțiru, Gheorghe Cibanu, Marin Ionescu, Titus Moisescu, Romanian musicology is just beginning to take up loose strings.

**Elena Tončeva**, *Die skitische Musikhandschriftenfamilie des bolgarskij Rospev vom 17. –18. Jh. und die spätpostbyzantinische Musikpraxis*

The writing of this seminal article on the transmission of the Putna musical traditions and of its gradually unfolding historical importance for the surrounding countries was triggered by the discovery of the three 'Skitic' MSS in Bucharest libraries in the early 1970s. 'Skitic' is the adjective coined by the author to denote the monastery called Skitul Mare (Great Skete) founded in 1612 in Pocutia (a region in Galitia) by Ukrainian hesychast monk Iov Knyaginitsky and archdeacon Theodosie from Putna Monastery. Written in

Kievan staff notation, and belonging to a class of musical MSS usually called in the former regions of the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth 'irmoloy', i. e. heirmologia, these three MSS are in fact anthologies of church chant exhibiting, with minor differences, not only the same structure and chant sequence related to the Vespers, Matins and the three liturgies known from Putna anthologies, but, most importantly, the same Greco-Slavonic bilingualism, and presence of Greek-only musical cycles for the Communion and Cherubic hymns. A supplementary hallmark of these three MSS is the presence of chants inscribed as Bulgarian, Moldavian, Greek, Kievan, Ostrogian, etc.

The musical examples analyzed comparatively in this paper support the hypothesis that the Skitul Mare tradition, possibly exhibited also in other Ukrainian musical documents of the 17<sup>th</sup>–18<sup>th</sup> centuries, encapsulates musical information on an earlier Byzantine chant tradition. This hypothesis is based on the fact that the Cherubic hymns reveal the addition of post-14<sup>th</sup> century musical material to an earlier tradition based on the preferred use of the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> modes.

**Gregory Myers**, *More Considerations on the Impact of the Turnovo Hymnographic School on Late Chant Development in Slavia Orthodoxa: Another Look at Evstatie's 1511 Song Book*

This contribution on the Putna tradition refers especially to the MS known as “Evstatie's Song Book” of 1511, and evaluates its typical combination of the old and the new, with features of both the pre- and post-Koukouzelean reform of Byzantine chant, typical also of the stylistically heterogeneous nature of contemporaneous Greek Akolouthiai. The numerous melismatic chants are replete with the additional melismatic syllables that are the hallmark feature of both the old Byzantine choir book or *Asmatikon*, and a small corpus of musical manuscripts that existed in Kievan Rus' between the 11<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> centuries, the five Paleoslavonic kondakaria. Starting from previous results attained by Dimitri Conomos, Anne Pennington and Elena Tončeva showing that the lineage of the material preserved in these sources could be traced back to the choral practices of at least the 13<sup>th</sup> century, while simultaneously exhibiting a strong affinity to contemporaneous Greek Akolouthia, the premise is put forward that this stylistic stability might be exhibited by a whole number of chants in the collection. Anne Pennington, while referring to Evstatie's song book, had suggested in fact that the notation preserved in the 12<sup>th</sup>-century *Zographou Trifologion* and *Bologna Psalter* could have even served as possible antecedents.

From the parallel perspectives of musical paleography and musical style, at least in part, the tradition exemplified by the chants in this anthology can not only be traced back to the scriptoria of the 14<sup>th</sup>-century Bulgarian capital, Veliko Turnovo, where both liturgical and musical traditions were melded, but to an even more distant time and place to what took root in Kievan Rus' and flourished more than two centuries earlier.

Finally, if indeed the composer of these settings was Koukouzeles, then by virtue of the universality associated with his name, they must certainly extend beyond the principalities that claim ownership or proprietorship of the manuscripts in which they are found, regardless of whether their provenance is Bulgarian, Serbian or Moldavian. It establishes them as important members within the orbit of the late Byzantine manuscript tradition, and thus a part of the greater whole of the venerable Byzantine tradition that created them.

**Anna Czekanowska**, *Ruthenian or Ukrainian Tradition? From Research into the Church and Folk Music of South-Eastern Europe*

The basic concept of the paper concentrates on the value of Greek and/or Slavonic tradition for the culture of southeastern Europe. The south of Europe constituted a sphere of influence not only of Latin culture, but also of culture derived from Greek tradition, as well as culture marked by oriental influence. The contribution of Slavonic culture is not to be overlooked either. The second basic concept concerns the essence of Ukrainian identity formulated as the question exposed in the title of the paper (Ruthenian or Ukrainian Tradition).

These concepts led to the concentration on the problem of cultural links and processes of cultural transmission, wherein the importance of the Wallachia-Moldavia route emerges as the crucial one. It concentrates on the significance of Bulgarian/Serbian Chant and the role of monasteries which transmitted this legacy.

Ukraine's cultural mediation and significance for southern Europe being beyond doubt, one major task for further research remains to establish to what extent the transmission of the Lvov cultural traditions can be linked to Ukrainian or Polish channels (mainly from the 16<sup>th</sup> century onwards). Of particular value is the confirmation of close links between church (old print from 1757) and folk tradition in this area. It

concerns specifically the repertory of local centres (from Poland, Slovakia as well as those in the Bug river basin).

Bearing in mind the great tradition of Kievan Rus and that of the Duchy of Galicia-Volhynia – both topical for this region –, the Ruthenian connection appears to be crucial. From the perspective of recent developments, the requirement is to focus on traditions that took shape over the last four centuries, and on that of the Ukrainian polyphonic chant in particular, the main channel for Ukrainian cultural identity.

**Gabriela Ocneanu**, *Al XII-lea manuscris din Școala de la Putna – manuscrisul de la Lvov*

The article introduces in detail the last-found member of the Putna family of 15<sup>th</sup>-16<sup>th</sup> century musical anthologies, MS 1060 of the Lvov Municipal Museum. Incomplete, with fairly large parts missing, this is nevertheless one of the best examples of elegantly written traditional collections of Vespers, Matins, and Liturgy chants characteristic of the Putna tradition. Some of the peculiarities of this MS are mentioned, such as the style of the OCS inscriptions and the way it fits the general lines of Putna musical scriptoria. After a brief codicological and liturgical analysis, follows a presentation of the anthology's authors and a detailed analysis of the semeiology used.

**Danica Petrović**, *A Polychronion to the Moldo-Wallachian King (Voivoda) John Alexander*

Following in the footsteps of Anne Pennington, this paper gives a new, musical analysis on the Polychronion in honour of the Moldo-Wallachian voivoda John Alexander Lăpușneanu (1552-1561; 1563-1568) which is to be found on f. 1 of MS E. D. Clarke 14, preserved in the Bodleian Library, Oxford, a liturgical anthology with Greek text and late-Byzantine notation, written in 1553, most probably on Mount Athos. The hymn on f. 409<sup>v</sup> of MS E. D. Clarke 14 is a Sticheron for the Entrance of the Mother of God into the Temple, with the unusual inscription Σέρβικον.

After the presentation of a brief historical background to epoch, and its musical culture this paper approaches the questions of who could have sang, composed, or written down this particular Polychronion. From linguistic analysis it would appear that singers were members of the Romanian Orthodox Church, possibly Romanian monks who had visited Mount Athos. Since musical analysis and comparison with Byzantine polychronia exclude a Greek author, it is safely assumed that the singer learnt the melody from an unknown Romanian author. Finally, the “musical presence” of the Polychronion to John Alexander in the Greek Liturgical Anthology could be tied to the existence of the Σέρβικον in the same collection. In both cases it was a Romanian, or a Serbian, singer who inspired a Greek musician to write down their melody. Thus two Church Slavonic hymns, the Polychronion to Moldo-Wallachian voivoda John Alexander, and the Σέρβικον enrich a Greek music Anthology from the middle of the 16<sup>th</sup> century.

**Adriana Sirli**, *Quelques chansons occidentales dans deux manuscrits grecs des Principautés Roumaines (première moitié du XIXe siècle)*

In the remarkable collection of Turkish, Greek, Arabic, Gipsy, Romanian, and other lay songs recorded in MS 129 of the Iași Metropolitan Library, written by Nikephoros Kantouniaries in 1813 at Golia Monastery in Iași, there are also the following Italian and French songs to be found: *Si le roi m'avait donné* (fol. 43r), *Que ne suis-je la fougère* (fol. 97r), *Je reviens de la guerre* (fol. 149r), *E al fin io son ben nata* (fol. 162v), *Une jeune meunière* (fol. 172r).

The presumed prototypes of these songs are described individually from French and Italian sources, and historical and literary references are supplied. At the end musical examples transcribed into the staff linear notation are provided.

**Marco D'Agostino**, *The Gospel Lectionary from the Muzeul Literaturii Române of Iași (Ms. Inv. Nr. 7030): a Palaeographical Study*

This is mainly a codicological analysis of MS 7030, preserved in the Romanian Literature Museum in Iași, is a large Gospel lectionary, noteworthy both for its length (ff. 392) and for its dimensions (mm 344 × 245). This MS was little studied – it goes unmentioned in Kurt Aland's most recently up-dated repertory – and was dated to the twelfth century and ascribed to two coeval hands as follows: ff. 1r-121v and 322r-392v to the first scribe and ff. 122r-320r to the second.

The MS is written by two different hands, but it is also made up of two sections, so not only the writing, but also the material structure of the codex appear different in the two sections. The Gospel

lectionary can thus be considered the sum of two distinct codicological units which were combined together. Consequently, separate codicological descriptions are provided of the two individual sections.

The manuscript had belonged to Nicholas, Archbishop of Bizye in Thrace, in ca. 1315-1317. This churchman is known as a collector of high quality manuscripts from the MS. Oxford, Christ Church gr. 25, a Gospel lectionary which on f. 4r has an identical note of possession, written here by the scribe of the Oxonian codex himself. In the case of the Iași codex it is not possible to say whether the hand which wrote the note is the one which restored the codex, and had now abandoned the archaistic writing or whether it is the hand of the archbishop himself. In conclusion, the history of the Iași codex may be reconstructed thus: after buying the mutilated manuscript, Nicholas, Archbishop of Bizye, had it restored in ca. 1315-1317 by a scribe who was very skilful at imitating archaic graphic forms, and finally had someone add (or added himself) the note of possession.

**Clement Haralam, arhim.,** *Slujba, viața și acatistul Binecredinciosului Voievod Ștefan cel Mare și Sfânt – 2 iulie*

A short description of the hymn composed in traditional Moldavian style by Fr Archimandrite Clement Haralam and his musical assistants of the choir of the Three Hierarchs Monastery to honour the 500<sup>th</sup> death anniversary of Stephen the Great, king of Moldavia (1457–1504).

**Traian Ocneanu,** *The School of Medieval Chant at the Monastery of Putna. Current State of Romanian Research*

This is an attempt to put in a historical perspective the School of Medieval Chant at the Monastery of Putna and the transmission of its musical traditions to the Orthodox communities of the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth in the 16<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> centuries. The strength of the Putna tradition in the 15<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> centuries was continued and possibly reinforced by the Skitul Mare tradition, and this continuity seems to have survived to this day in the liturgical practice of the Orthodox Slav countries, and in Romania. In-depth comparative analyses of the MS sources brought to light so far would be necessary in order to uncover the original roots, presumed to lie in the early Greek Byzantine traditions, the autochthonous innovations brought by local composers, and the extent to which these combined traditions have been transmitted to neighbouring communities.

**Elena Chircev,** *Palin și leghe în cântările liturgice din manuscrisul oriental nr. 365 de la Biblioteca Academiei Române, filiala Cluj-Napoca*

This paper introduces the functionality of the formulae *palin* and *lege* as found in MS 365 of the Library of the Romanian Academy at Cluj-Napoca, by referring the musical contexts to the ones identified by Gheorghe Ciobanu, Marin Ionescu and Titus Moisescu in the Putna tradition, and especially in Evstatie's chants.

**Sebastian Barbu-Bucur,** *Tezaur muzical românesc de tradiție bizantină la Muntele Athos*

A continuation of work started a quarter of a century ago regarding the inventorying, and cataloguing of the important repositories of Romanian musical MSS found at Mount Athos, starting with the Romanian Monastery of Prodromul. A wealth a new information is provided on a great number of previously unresearched MSS.

**Vasile Grăjdian,** *Lucrări publicate în cadrul proiectului C. N. C. S. I. S. „Cercetarea sistematică și valorificarea tezaurului de oralitate al cântării de strană din bisericile Arhiepiscopiei Sibiului“*

A report on the status of work and the studies published within the framework of a project funded by the Consiliul Național al Cercetării Științifice din Învățământul Superior (C. N. C. S. I. S.) under grants No. M. E. C. T.–C. N. C. S. I. S 290/2002 și 368/2003 and 2004 for researching the orality of church chant in the region found under the ecclesiastical jurisdiction of the Archbishopric of Sibiu. The research was undertaken by a team formed of academic staff and research personnel from the Andrei Șaguna Faculty of Theology and of Lucian Blaga University of Sibiu.

The project was conducted in four stages: 1) the preparation by way of statistical studies of research priorities; 2) the collection of live musical evidence by way of field recordings, starting in the villages; 3) the

selection and sorting out of the recorded musical material; 4) carrying out advanced musical and ethnomusicological research on the collected material.

**Petru Stanciu**, *Cultura muzicală de tradiție bizantină în centrul Transilvaniei, secolele XVIII–XIX*

A concise presentation of the author's PhD thesis with same title. After a brief historical perspective of Transylvanian society and culture follows an introduction of the known schools and teachers of psaltic chant in Transylvania, and a brief description of the specific question of Transylvanian orality founded on individual learning and oral transmission of knowledge from the basic books of the Orthodox rite, and of its liturgical music. An overview of the circulation of printed liturgical books is then given, and a sketch of a general catalogue for MSS of church chant, in various musical notational systems, is offered.

**Vasile Vasile**, *Liturghierul lui Nectarie, protopsaltul Sfântului Munte Athos*

This paper presents preliminary results of the efforts to prepare for publication an anthology of the works of Nectarie, protopsaltis of the Holy Mount, in both manuscript and printed form. This will include the fruition of efforts to print in critical editions Nectarie's *Lenten Chants*, *Vigil Chants*, *Greek Chants*, *Hymns to the Mother of the Lord*, and then the *Doxastarion*, *Mathimatarion*, and *The Lord's Burial Service* in addition to Nectarie's *Stikherarion*, which was done by Fr Archimandrite Clement Haralam and prepared for publication by the Iași Centre for Byzantine Studies.

The intention is to continue these efforts to include *The Chants of the Holy Liturgy*, a monumental undertaking that would give to the world at large a musical treasure in large part still unknown, even to Greek research.

**Hieromonk Ephraim**, *A Comparison of the Quantitative, Qualitative, and Spiritual Differences Between Byzantine and Western Music*

A description that should find a wide readership, as it reasserts the views of a practicing Orthodox monk on the differences between Western and Eastern chant from both spiritual-aesthetic and historical perspective. These quantitative, qualitative, and spiritual differences cannot be fully appreciated simply by reading a description of them; it is necessary to hear a proper execution of Byzantine chant in the context of a worship service in order to appreciate its ethos and to understand how it differs from Western secular music. Furthermore, any attempt to perform Byzantine chant solely from music written in Western staff notation will inevitably be inadequate, since the latter is determinative while Byzantine notation is descriptive. Nevertheless, such an attempt is necessitated by current trends in Orthodox churches of the West, the majority of which do not use the traditional Byzantine chant developed by the saints. On the contrary, they prefer music written in Western notation that is either completely heterodox in origin, or if it is of Orthodox origin, it has been seriously altered by secular or the heterodox influences such as harmonization, polyphony, or using the accompaniment of an organ.

**Hilda Iacob**, *Coordonate bizantine în creația compozitorului Sigismund Toduță*

The musical universe of Sigismund Toduță's works is built on essential modalism, whose double roots in Romanian folklore and Byzantine chant traditions combine harmoniously with Western Gregorian and Renaissance influences in polyphonic and heterophonic renewals. Sigismund Toduță's works bear testimony to an uncanny combination of the ison, the folk-wise heterophony and western polyphony. A few examples illustrate some of the major types of Sigismund Toduță's preferred musical combinations.

